IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURE CEIVED FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF ALABAMA NORTHERN DIVISION 2006 JUL 21 A 11: 19

FRANK BLAIR,	DEBRA P. HACKET I, CLIV U.S. DISTRICT COURT MIDDLE DISTRICT ALA
Plaintiff,)
v.)) CIVIL ACTION NUMBER
AETNA LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY, AMERICOLD) 2:00 CV U51-MEF
LOGISTICS, LLC, DAWN)
SANFORD, et al.,)
Defendants.	<i>)</i>

DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS OR IN THE ALTERNATIVE FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

Defendants Aetna Life Insurance Company ("Aetna"), AmeriCold Logistics, LLC ("AmeriCold"), and Dawn Sanford (collectively "Defendants"), move this Court to grant summary judgment in their favor. As grounds for this motion, Defendants state as follows:

1. Plaintiff (and AmeriCold employee) Frank Blair, the alleged widower of Sandra Blair, has sued Defendants for benefits under the Life Insurance and Accidental Death & Personal Loss Coverage (the "Plan"). Plaintiff has not, as required by the Plan's administrative procedures, appealed Aetna's initial denial of his spousal life insurance claim. Instead, Plaintiff has filed the Complaint in this lawsuit. (Aff. of

Ronald L. Campo, Jr. at ¶ 8, which is attached as Ex. 2 to Defs.' Notice of Removal).

- 2. Plaintiff's Complaint fails to plead unavailability or exhaustion of administrative remedies. Therefore, this Court may in its discretion dismiss Plaintiff's claim. *Byrd v. MacPaper, Inc.*, 961 F.2d 157, 160 (11th Cir. 1992).
- 3. "The law is clear in this circuit that plaintiffs in ERISA actions must exhaust available administrative remedies before suing in federal court." Counts v. Am. Gen. Life and Accident Ins. Co., 111 F.3d 105, 107 (11th Cir. 1997); see also Harrison v. United Mine Workers of Am. 1974 Benefit Plan & Trust, 941 F. 2d 1190, 1193 (11th Cir. 1991). Because Plaintiff has not exhausted the available administrative remedies, this Court should dismiss this action against Defendants, or alternatively, grant summary judgment in their favor.
- 4. In addition, and as reflected in Paragraph 6 of Ronald Campo's Affidavit, the Plan's express terms provide spousal life insurance coverage only to a claimant's "legal spouse." Plaintiff and his wife, Sandra Blair, were divorced in 1997. (See Case Action Summary for the matter of Sandra Blair v. Frank Blair, DR 1997-460, in the Circuit Court of Montgomery County, Alabama, attached hereto as Ex. 1; Sandra Blair's

Death Certificate, attached hereto as Ex. 2 (documenting that Sandra Blair was divorced at the time of her death)). Accordingly, Plaintiff was not married to Sandra Blair when she passed away on June 16, 2004. Because Plaintiff cannot satisfy the express terms of the Plan's insurance coverage requirements, this Court should grant summary judgment in Defendants' favor.

WHEREFORE, Defendants request this Court to dismiss this action for failure to plead exhaustion of administrative remedies or for failure to satisfy the Plan's insurance coverage requirements, or, in the alternative, to grant summary judgment in Defendants' favor.

Respectfully Submitted,

James S. Christie, Jr. (CHR011)

Amelia T. Driscoll (DRI016)

Bradley Arant Rose & White LLP

1819 Fifth Avenue North

Birmingham, AL 35203-2104

Telephone: (205) 521-8000

Facsimile: (205) 521-8800

Attorneys for Defendants

Aetna Life Insurance Company

AmeriCold Logistics, LLC,

and Dawn Sanford

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this date served the foregoing on:

Ralph Bohanan, Jr. Bohanan & Knight, P.C. Suite 318 North Birmingham, Alabama 35243

by placing a copy in the United States Mail, postage prepaid, on this 21st day of July, 2006.

One of the Attorneys for Defendants

EXHIBIT "1"



OffLine Case Detail

Complete Through 7/11/2006

Settings **Parties** Witness List

You can check this case in the RealTime System here Case County Case Number DR199700046000 JID RHD REF SANDRA MICHELLE BLAIR VS FRANK BLAIR Style DRDR DIVORCE Code Type Filed 4/17/1997 Trial Child Status **Plaintiffs** 001 Defendants 001 DJID RHD S - SETTLED/ANSWER WAIVER 6/3/1997 %> Court Action For В DHR ADC UIFSA DNA FLAG ORIGN Trial Days 1st Date DISSOLU: X CUSTOD: LEGSEP: MOD: ANNUL: PROTORD: TRO: SUPPORT: PATRNTY: IWO: GARN: ARREAR: CONTMPT: ALIMNY: Amount FREQ Pay To 000 Cost Paid By Settings Date 1 Que 1 Time 1 Description Date 2 Que 2 Time 2 Description Date 3 Que 3 Time 3 Description Date 4 Que 4 Time 4 Description Cont Date Why Cont # RevJmt Admin Date Why Appeal Date CRT 00000000000 Case TBNV1 TBNV2 DSDT DTYP Comment 1 Comment 2 Party 1 Party C001 Name BLAIR SANDRA MICHELLE Туре INDX FRANK ANAM **JID** RHD SSN XXX-XX-5796 Address 1 26 ELCAR CIRCLE Sex DOB 10/12/1964 Address 2 Race Country บร City MONTGOMERY AL 36108 Phone 000-000-0000 Atty 1 FRE021 Atty 2 Atty 3 Atty 4 Atty 5 Atty 6 ssued Туре Reissue Туре Return Туре Return Туре Service Туре Serv On Ву Answer Туре NS Not NA Not Warrant Туре Arrest CACT Date 6/3/1997 For Exep AMT 242.65 Cost Other Satisfied Comment Party 2 Party D001 Name **BLAIR FRANK** Туре NDX SANDRA ANAM **JID** RHD SSN XXX-XX-3290 Address 1 3126 RANE DRIVE Sex М DOB 5/21/1958 Address 2 Race Country US City MONTGOMERY AL 36108 Phone 000-000-0000 Atty 1 000000 Atty 2 Atty 3 Atty 4 Atty 5 Atty 6 ssued Туре Reissue Туре Return Туре Return Туре Service Туре Serv On By Answer Туре NS Not NA Not Warrant Туре Arrest CACT 6/3/1997 Date For В Exep AMT 242.65 Cost Other Satisfied Comment

Party 3	·····				
	H001	Name	AMERICOLD LOGISTICS. LLC	Туре	В
INDX	WITHHOLDER	ANAM		DID	RHD
SSN	XXX-XX-0460	Address 1	10 GLENLAKE PKWAY	Sex	
DOB		Address 2	SUITE 800	Race	
Country		City	ATLANTA GA 30328	Phone	000-000-0000
Atty 1		Atty 2	Atty 3	Atty 4	
Atty 5]	Atty 6			_
Issued		Туре	Reissue	Туре	}
Return]	Туре	Return	Туре	
Service]	Туре	Serv On	Ву]
Answer]	Туре	NS Not	NA Not]
Warrant]	Туре	Arrest		<u>.</u>
CACT]	Date	For	Exep]
AMT]	Cost	Other	Satisfied]
Comment					
Case Action	n Summary				

se Action Summary			
Date	Code	Comments	Operator
4/17/1997 10:17:58 AM	FILE	FILED THIS DATE: 04/17/97	TAF
4/17/1997 10:17:59 AM	TDMN	NON-JURY TRIAL REQUESTED	TAF
4/17/1997 10:17:59 AM	ASSJ	ASSIGNED TO JUDGE: RICHARD H. DORROUGH	TAF
4/17/1997 10:27:32 AM	PART	BLAIR SANDRA MICHELLE ADDED AS C001	TAF
4/17/1997 10:27:33 AM	ATTY	LISTED AS ATTORNEY FOR C001: FREEMAN, DOUGLAS	TAF
4/17/1997 10:28:10 AM	PART	BLAIR FRANK ADDED AS D001	TAF
4/17/1997 10:28:11 AM	ATTY	LISTED AS ATTORNEY FOR D001: PRO SE	TAF
4/17/1997 10:28:38 AM	TEXT	1. PETITION FOR DIVORCE	TAF
4/17/1997 10:28:39 AM	TEXT	2. ANSWER & WAIVER	TAF
4/17/1997 10:28:40 AM	TEXT	3. AFFIDAVIT	TAF
4/17/1997 10:28:41 AM	TEXT	4. SEPARATION AGREEMENT	TAF
4/17/1997 3:55:39 PM	TEXT	5. ORDER OF ATTENDANCE	MER
5/20/1997 1:29:40 PM	TEXT	6. ORDER: TEN DAYS NOTICE	BEB
5/29/1997 4:50:13 PM	TEXT	7. FIT CERT. FOR WIFE & CHILD (FILED 4/17/97)	MER
6/4/1997 8:24:19 AM	CACJ	COURT ACTION JUDGE: RICHARD H. DORROUGH	TAF
6/4/1997 8:24:20 AM	DISP	DISPOSED ON: 06/03/97 BY DIVORCE 542	TAF
6/4/1997 8:29:48 AM	TEXT	9. IWO	TAF
6/4/1997 8:29:49 AM	TEXT	10. CY #9 SHERIFF/EMPL (EX: 6-13-97)	SHM
6/9/1997 1:49:05 PM	JAMT	JUDGMENT OF \$242.65 AGAINST C001 ON 06/09/97	VIL
6/9/1997 1:49:51 PM	JAMT	JUDGMENT OF \$242.65 AGAINST D001 ON 06/09/97	VIL
7/11/1997 8:23:00 AM	TEXT	11. EMPLOYER'S ANSWER	SHM
9/12/2000 12:30:13 PM	PART	AMERICOLD LOGISTICS. LLC ADDED AS H001 (AV21)	MAM
10/17/2000 10:19:39 AM	VERI	IWO STATUS CHANGED FROM: P TO V (AV27)	BRH
5/3/2002 10:51:51 AM	TEXT	12. EMPLOYERS NOTICE PAYROLL CHANGE FORM WEEKLY	SHM
5/3/2002 10:51:52 AM	TEXT	TO BIWEEKLY	SHM

EXHIBIT "2"

	Case 2:06-cv-0065	51-MEF-SRW	Document 2-3	Filed 07/21/	/2006 F	Page 2 of 2	
	ari kod otari odonimic	enter represe	ALABA	534	remontantant	T 10 MAN AL TO THE TOTAL OF THE	
PE IN PERMANENT ACK INK DO NOT SE GREEN, RED, OR UE INK.	County (1888) File Number –		CERTIFICATE	OF DEATH Strike File Number	11,077(0)		
3 5	i biccasto-hamil ins Sandra	Michelle	BLAIR	Dutie 16, 20	0.4	OUNTY OF DEATH Montgomery	
3.00 m	4 CITY DWW. OR LOCATION OF DEATH AND ZIP CODE 1. INSIDE CHICLES 1. IN SIDE CHICLES 1. IN PROPERTY OR DOTHER INSTITUTION—III not in entires, give sureet and numbers 1. Speciment result in the sureet and num						
	7 IF HOSPITAL (Specify Inpatient, ER or Outpatient	Мехісап. Р	NIC ORIGIN (Special Xes or No) II Yes, Special Cu Pueno Rican, etc. NO	Blac	k	Female	
	3 9 YRS. MOS.	DAYS HOURS	P\$250.600 P*3,5370 7880 783 3		14. DECEASED'S SOU	JAL SECURITY NUMBER 3 6 - 5 7 9 6	
	15 EOUCATION (Specify ONLY impliest orace compositions) Elementary or High School (0-12)	College (1-4 or 5+1 1 - Tridowed: Dir	TATUS (Specify Married, Never Married, " Worked " Ced	17. SURVIVING SPOUSE (II wile, give r	naiden Hamel	18. Was Lectagent ever in Arme Forces (Specify Yes or No) N O	
	19. STATE OF BIRTH (II not in USA, name country) Alabama	20. RESIDENCE-STATE Alabama	21. COUNTY Mont	The state of the s	DWM. DR LOCATION AND Z Ltg.omery	ZIP CODE	
	. 23. INSIDE CITY LIMITS 24. STREET AND HE (Specify Yes or flo)		25. INFORMAN	II—Name and Address Ter	rance E , Montgor	iillups mery, AL 36117	
	26 USUAL OCCUPATION (Give single) work done at	during mass of working lide even if retired)	27, KINI	ontgomery Co		W.C. 82	
	28. FATHER—NAME First	Middle Last Lewis H	1a 1 1 2 3 3 MAI	IDEN NAME OF MOTHER— First	Middle	e Lasi	
	30 OISPOSITION OF BODY Specing Buttal, Cremain Donation Hospiral Disposal, Other Buile	on Aestel 31 DATE OF DISPOSITIO	32 CEMETERY OR CREMAT	(ORY Name	33. LOCATION—(City		
	34 FUNERAL HOME Dame and Address 2284 V. Fairview	Phillips-Rile	y F. H. 35 TIMERALDI	RECTOR—Signature	م د ماد	36. DATE SIGNED BY FUNERAL DIRECTOR	
	137. V Certifying Physician Physic	con candidan cauca of death. To the best	st of my knowledge death occurred at the time a and/or investmenton, in my ocinion, death occur	in triate and the thirty several and mann	ar eranar - 38. DATE SIC		
	Signature: 39. TIME AND DATE OF DEATH	47 U 1 1	ONOUNCED DEAD (For Earoner/ M.E. JER ONN)			SE OF DRATH them 46)	
	8.35am (C/16) 42. ADDRESS OF PERSON WHO COMPLETED CAYS	SE OF DEATH (Item 46)		NAVID ntgomen	G 1110	SRR SON MD	
, and to	ا استو مسر سو د ۱۱	SOUTH BL	For State of County use o	3 6 11 (TE FILED (Morris Day, Year)	
		aenda K	Javi		9	ulz 8 2004	
	Le cont. F.		MEDICAL CERTI		ko o-Aleman	***	
	40. PART I Enter the discases, injuries, or complicate HMMEDIATE CAUSE (Final) disease of condition resulting in death)	LUN	CHV CHV	CEK	1000 1000 1000	APPROXIMATE INTERVAL BETWEEN ONSET	
		DUE TO (OIT AS A CONSEQUENCE OF): b			som was	J.	
100 mg	Sequentially list conditions if any leading to immediate cause. Evice UNDERLYING CAUSE (Disease or mining that initiated events	C TO YOR AS A COMSEQUENCE OFF	y Wally of the second of the s	Marian and the second s	MONTH OF THE	er er en	
APT (C. C.). The contract of	resulting an death) LAST	DUE TO (OR AS A CONSEQUENCE OF).	Alexandri Maria				
	1.3		v court and an analysis of the same and an analysis of the	(%) dec) 3-157569 		48. WAS THERE A PRECKANCY IN LAST 42 DAYS (Specify) as No. or Unit.]	
in a second second	49. MANNER OF DEATH Specify—Accident, Homein	ride, Suicide, Undetermined Cycumstances, P	Silvan (1985) 20 (1997)) (Specify tes or	nddros considered in determining cause of death? Not	

This is a true and exact copy of the record on file with the Montgomery County Heath Departme

55. INJURY AT WORK (Specify Yes or No.) SE. PLACE OF INJURY - (Specify at home, farm, street, fectory, place building, etc.)

This is a lagal record and must be filed within five (5) days after death.

57. LOCATION OF HIJURY ISsues or R.F D. No., City of Town, State

्रे ADPH-HS 2/Kev. 11-9

